Development of the WHO Environmental Noise Guidelines

Sabine Janssen
Senior Policy Advisor

The Netherlands Ministry of Infrastructure and Water Management
DG Environment & International Affairs

19 March 2019
Paris, UIC Headquarters
Noise sources considered

- Road traffic
- Railway
- Wind turbines
- Aircraft
- Leisure
Environmental noise indicators

- $L_{den}$: A-weighted average sound pressure level, measured over a 24 hour period, with a 10dB penalty for night and a 5dB penalty for evening.

- $L_{night}$: A-weighted average sound pressure level measured over at 8 hour period during night time, usually 23:00 to 07:00 hrs.

- Noise exposure at the most exposed façade, outdoors.

- $L_{A,max}$: Maximum sound pressure level for single events - important in sleep studies.
Guideline development process - guideline groups and main steps

1. Systematic review process
2. Grading the evidence
3. Developing recommendations
Systematic Reviews

1. Cardiovascular disease and metabolic effects
2. Annoyance
3. Sleep disturbance
4. Cognitive impairment
5. Hearing impairment and tinnitus
6. Adverse birth outcomes
7. Quality of life, mental health and wellbeing
8. Interventions to reduce noise and improve health
Grading the evidence

Assessment of the overall quality of evidence by Systematic Review Teams:

- Study limitations
- Inconsistency of results
- Indirectness of evidence
- Imprecision of effect estimate
- Publication bias
- Magnitude of effect
- Plausible confounding
- Dose-response gradient

OVERALL QUALITY OF EVIDENCE

- High quality
- Moderate quality
- Low quality
- Very low quality
GRADE interpretations of quality of evidence

- **High quality**: further research very unlikely to change certainty of effect estimate
- **Moderate quality**: further research is likely to have an important impact on the certainty of the effect estimate and may change the estimate
- **Low quality**: further research is very likely to have an important impact on the certainty of the effect estimate and is likely to change the estimate
- **Very low quality**: any effect estimate is uncertain
Developing recommendations

Factors to be considered
- Quality of Evidence
- Balance of Benefits and harms
- Values and Preferences
- Resource Use

Types of Recommendations
- Strong recommendation
- Conditional recommendation

World Health Organization
Organisation mondiale de la Santé
Weltpolitischesgesundheitsorganisation
## Priority health outcomes and relevant risk increases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority health outcomes (DW)</th>
<th>Relevant risk increase for setting guideline level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of IHD (0.405)</td>
<td>5%RR increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of hypertension (0.117)</td>
<td>10% RR increase</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Highly annoyed (0.02)</td>
<td>10% absolute risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Highly sleep disturbed (0.07)</td>
<td>3% absolute risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanent hearing impairment (0.0150)</td>
<td>No risk due to environmental noise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading and oral comprehension (0.006)</td>
<td>One month delay in reading age</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Rationale for guideline for Road Traffic Noise - average exposure levels for priority health outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of health outcome evidence</th>
<th>Benchmark level</th>
<th>Evidence quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incidence of IHD:</strong> 5% RR increase at 59.3 dB(L_{den}) (\text{RR}=1.08) per 10 dB increase</td>
<td>5% increase of RR</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incidence of hypertension:</strong> One study met inclusion criteria. No noise effect</td>
<td>10% increase of RR</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Prevalence of highly annoyed:</strong> Absolute risk of 10% HA at 53.3 dB(L_{den})</td>
<td>10% absolute risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sleep disturbance:</strong> 3% HSD at 45.4 dB(L_{night})</td>
<td>3% absolute risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(53 \text{dB } L_{den}\)  
\(45 \text{dB } L_{night}\)

---

*Images are suppressed for brevity.*
Exposure-response relationship road traffic noise annoyance


# Rationale for guideline for Railway Noise - average exposure levels for priority health outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of health outcome evidence</th>
<th>Benchmark level</th>
<th>Evidence quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of IHD: No studies available</td>
<td>5% increase of RR</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of hypertension: One study met inclusion criteria. No noise effect</td>
<td>10% increase of RR</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevalence of highly annoyed: Absolute risk of 10%HA at 53.7dB $L_{den}$</td>
<td>10% absolute risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep disturbance: 3%HSD at 43.7dB $L_{night}$</td>
<td>3% absolute risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

54dB $L_{den}$

44dB $L_{night}$

World Health Organization

Organisation mondiale de la Santé

Weltsgesundheitsorganisation

Всемирная организация здравоохранения
Exposure-response relationship railway noise annoyance
Rationale for guideline for Aircraft Noise - average exposure levels for priority health outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of health outcome evidence</th>
<th>Benchmark level</th>
<th>Evidence quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of IHD: Relevant risk increase occurs at 52.6dB L_{den} RR=1.09 per 10dB increase</td>
<td>5% increase of RR</td>
<td>Very low quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of hypertension: One study met inclusion criteria. No noise effect</td>
<td>10% increase of RR</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevalence of highly annoyed: Absolute risk of 10%HA at 45.4 dB L_{den}</td>
<td>10% absolute risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep disturbance: 11% HSD at 40dB L_{night}</td>
<td>3% absolute risk</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

45dB L_{den}

40dB L_{night}

strong
## Rationale for guideline for Wind Turbine Noise - average exposure levels for priority health outcomes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of health outcome evidence</th>
<th>Benchmark level</th>
<th>Evidence quality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of IHD: Could not be used</td>
<td>5% increase of RR</td>
<td>No studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incidence of hypertension: Could not be used</td>
<td>10% increase of RR</td>
<td>No studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prevalence of highly annoyed: Exposure-response of four studies absolute risk of 10%HA (outdoors) at 45 dB $L_{den}$</td>
<td>10% absolute risk</td>
<td>Low quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sleep disturbance: 6 studies - no consistent results</td>
<td>3% absolute risk</td>
<td>Low quality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$45dB \ L_{den}$
To protect health

**WHO/Europe noise guidelines**

recommend reducing noise levels below:

- **53 dB (45 dB for night)**
- **54 dB (44 dB for night)**
- **45 dB (40 dB for night)**
- **45 dB**
Scope and implementation of the guidelines

• WHO provides **health based guideline values**

• Not **limit values** to directly use in legislation

• Implementation requires balancing benefits and harms, values/preferences

• Impact or cost-benefit analyses are not within scope of the WHO guidelines

• NL started impact analysis of (partly) implementing insights from the guideline
Thank you!

Sabine Janssen
Senior Policy Advisor

The Netherlands Ministry of Infrastructure and Water Management
DG Environment & International Affairs

19 March 2019
Paris, UIC Headquarters